

THIS IS A SUMMARY OF APPEALS BEFORE THE COMMISSION IN 2007:

## BEFORE THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION:

CASE#	DEPT	FILED	RULE OR CODE	ISSUE	APPEAL SUMMARY/STATUS	HEARING OFFICER
07-03-013	DoIT	12-13-07		Whether Administrative Leave is justified	Administrative leave	TBD

## DELEGATED TO THE OFFICE OF THE HEARING EXAMINER

CASE#	DEPT	FILED	RULE OR CODE	ISSUE	APPEAL SUMMARY/STATUS	HEARING OFFICER
07-01-012	Police	10-23-07		Whether discharge was for justifiable cause		ОНЕ
07-01-011	SPU	8-22-07		Whether demotion was for justifiable cause	Appellant alleges position was reallocated without a selection process in 2005. The department made a demotion and transfer recommendation in 2007. Appellant submitted written appeal (interdepartmental) to department appealing demotion, transfer and additional one year probationary period. Department demoted appellant in 2007 and required appellant to serve an additional one-year probationary period. Reviewed by the Commission at its September 19 meeting and delegated to the Office of the Hearing Examiner. Pre-hearing conference scheduled for October 17, 2007. Hearing scheduled for January 8, 2008.	

CASE #	DEPT	FILED	RULE OR CODE	ISSUE	APPEAL SUMMARY/STATUS	HEARING OFFICER
07-01-006	HSD	4-3-07	4.04.070(6) d	Whether lemotion was for ustifiable cause.	Appellant alleges faulty investigation finding he discriminated against subordinate which led to demotion. 1st Pre-Hearing scheduled for May 2, 2007. Hearing scheduled to continue on October 26, 2007. Findings and Decision issued by the Offi of the Hearing Examiner. Commission to review at its next scheduled meeting December 19, 2007. Commission reviewed and affirmed the decision of the Hearing Examiner.	Order Issued ce 12/20/07
07-03-009	SDOT	8-7-07		Whether classification level was established in accordance with established laws, rules and procedures.	Appellant alleges work performed falls into a higher classification. Alleges co-worker is performing same job functions at higher classification. Executive Director dismissed for lack of jurisdiction. On August 15, 2007, Appellant submitted a Petition for Review of the Executive Directors decision. Commission considered at its September 19, 2007 meeting and dismissed for lack of jurisdiction	Dismissal Order Issued 8/20/07
07-03-008	SPU	6-11-07	Pers. Rules 1.3.3 Progressive Discipline; 1.5.3; 1.5.5;1.5.6;1.5.7;1. 5.8 Performance Management; 2.1.3 Classification; 3.1.4B Step Pay	Whether demotion was for justifiable cause.	Appellant alleges personnel rules were not followed regarding corrective disciplinary actions/demotion  Commission to review briefs to determine jurisdiction at its July 18, 2007 meeting. Commission requested parties provide further information clarifying the issues.  Commission reviewed at its September 19, 2007 meeting and dismissed as the employee was exempt, and other issues were not timely filed.	Dismissal Order Issued 9/19/07

CASE#	DEPT	FILED	RULE OR CODE	ISSUE		APPEAL SUMMARY/STATUS	HEARING OFFICER
07-01-010	Sea Ctr.	7-10-07	Seattle Center Disciplinary Action Policy 7.1.1; 7.1.2; 7.1 Weingarten Due Process		r	Whether due process rights were observed in administering the disciplinary process. Department and Appellant reached a resolution. Appellant withdrew appeal August 16, 2007.	OHE Issued Dismissal Order 8/16/07
07-07-001	SPU	1-2-07	4.04.230 progressive with Discipline; Personnel Rules 1.5.3 at through 1.5.7; CDL discontinuous progressive with the personnel Rules 1.5.3 at through 1.5.7; CDL discontinuous progressive with the personnel Rules 1.5.7; CDL discontinuous progressive	Whether due rocess rights vere bserved in the dministratio of the isciplinary rocess.	counse Pre-He ordere determ pendin issued 2007 r	s reprimand does not fit violation or infraction. Coaching or eling did not occur before higher discipline was given. 1 <sup>st</sup> earing Conference scheduled for February 23, 2007. Parties d to submit briefs regarding jurisdiction. Hearing to be nined if Hearing Officer rules CSC has jurisdiction. Decision ag Hearing Officer review of briefs. Memorandum Decision by Hearing Officer. Commission to review at its July 18, meeting. Commission affirmed decision of Hearing or. Appeal was dismissed.	Dismissal Order Issued 7/24/07

CASE#	DEPT	FILED	RULE OR CODE	ISSUE	APPEAL SUMMARY/STATUS	HEARING OFFICER
07-01-002	SDOT	1-22-07	Rule 1.3 Progressive Discipline; 1.5 Performance Mgmt.	Whether Demotion was for justifiable cause	Hearing Conference scheduled for February 26, 2007.	Dismissal Order Issued 7/3/07
07-4-007	SDOT	4-5-07	Personnel Rule 4.1	Whether promotional process was administered in accordance with established laws, rule and procedures.	Appellant alleges selection process for Internal Applicants was not followed. 1st Pre-Hearing scheduled for May 2, 2007. Hearing continued to June 25, 2007. Hearing Examiner issued Findings and Decision. Commission will review at its July 18, 2007, meeting. Commission affirmed decision of Hearing Examiner. Appeal was dismissed.	Dismissal Order Issued 7/19/07
06-01-013	Fleets	10-4-06	5	Whether suspension was for justifiable cause.	Appellant alleges he was given no specific instructions the night of his alleged insubordination of ignoring supervisor's instructions. 1 <sup>st</sup> Pre-hearing conference scheduled for 11-2-06. 1 <sup>st</sup> Pre-Hearing conference scheduled for 11-28-06 postponed until appellant representative is available. 1 <sup>st</sup> Pre-hearing conference scheduled for February 26, 2007. Hearing scheduled for April 25 & 26, 2007. Parties closing briefs due May 1 2007. Hearing Officer issued decision. Pending Commission review at its June 20, 2007 meeting. Commission affirmed decision of Hearing Officer. Appeal was dismissed.	Order Issued 6/6/07

CASE#	DEPT	FILED	RULE OR CODE	ISSUE	APPEAL SUMMARY/STATUS	HEARING OFFICER
06-05-005	DPD	3-16-06	SMC 4.04.180.A. 1; 4.04- 180.A.3;4.0 4-180.B.2; 4.04-180.B	Whether evaluation was performed in accordance with established laws, rules, and procedures.	Departments lack of timeliness of performance evaluation. 11-2-06 Hearing Officer issued Appellant an Order for Response to brief filed by Respondent (see CSC No. 06-07-008) due by 11-16-06. On 11-16-06, Appellant submitted brief in response to department. On 12-11-06 hearing officer Gary McLean issued an Order to Show Cause, appellant has until 12-22-06 to submit and Order to Show Cause why the appeal should not be dismissed for lack of jurisdiction. Pending review by Hearing Officer. Memorandum Decision issued. Pending Commission review at it July 18, 2007 meeting. Commission affirmed decision of Hearing Officer. Appeal was dismissed.	Dismissal Order Issued 7/24/07

06-03-015	SDOT	12-21-06	Whether leave policies were administered in accordance with established laws, rules and procedures.	Appellant contends he was placed on Administrative leave for reasons not clarified by department. Ist Pre-hearing conference scheduled for January 23, 2007. 1st Pre-hearing conference scheduled for January 23, 2007 was postponed. 2-28-07 Respondent submitted Motion for Continuance 3-14-07 Hearing Officer issued an Order Granting Motion for Continuance of First Pre-Hearing. 3-27-07 Appellant notified Commission staff via email requesting 1st PHC. Executive Director issued notification to Department to respond no later than 4/3/07 with objections. 1st Pre-Hearing scheduled for April 19, 2007. Hearing scheduled for June 27 & 28, 2007. Appeal dismissed. Appellant failed to appear at scheduled hearing.	Dismissal Order Issued 6/27/07
-----------	------	----------	---	--	--------------------------------------

CASE#	DEPT.	FILED		ISSUE		APPEAL SUMMARY	STATUS
06-01-006		FILED 4-13-06	Personnel Rules 1.3.3 C 4 & 5 retaliator y discharge , denial of due	Whether discharge was for justifiable cause. Whether due process rights were observed in the administration of the disciplinary	and adm Cor July 21, Find Exa 10-9	APPEAL SUMMARY  Dellant alleges termination was not for justifiable cause of the disciplinary process. 1st Pre-hearing inference Scheduled for May 26, 2006. Hearing schedule of 11-13, 2006. Hearing/closing arguments held on July 2006. Hearing continued until September 29, 2006. Idings and Decision issued by Office of the Hearing inference 10-2-06. Petition for review filed by Respondent 19-06. Opposition to Petition for Review filed by Appellant 17-06. Commission reviewed at its October 25, 2006	Dismissal Order Issued 6/5/07
			-	disciplinary process.	mee the cita dec: Nov the The	eting. Commission reviewed at its October 25, 2006 eting. Commission granted respondent until November 2 opportunity to submit the transcripts and include record tions in its brief. Commission deferred issuance of ision until its November 15, 2006 meeting. At its wember 15, 2006 meeting, the Commission deliberated on Petition for Review and Hearing Examiner's Decision. Commission agreed to issue a decision in the upcoming eks. December 1, 2006, the Commission issued a morandum Decision Order on Seattle Center's Petition for	
					Peti Exa pay an C 200 for Hea sett	riew. The Commission denied the Seattle Center's ation for Review and affirmed the decision of the Hearing aminer. The Commission ordered reinstatement and back to appellant. December 15, 2006, the Commission issued Order for parties to agree on a remedy due January 3, 7. December 29, 2006, respondent filed an Application Writ of Review with King County Superior Court. Review uring scheduled for August 13, 2007. Parties reached lement. Case dismissed in King County Superior art March 27, 2007.	

CASE #	DEPT.	FILED	RULE OR CODE	ISSUE	APPEAL SUMMARY/STATUS	STATUS
06-01-012	SDOT	10-2-06		Whether discipline imposed was more harsh than others involved.	Appellant alleges he was punished more severe than other crew members involved in incident. 1st Pre-hearing scheduled for 10-24-06. 2nd Pre-Hearing conference scheduled for 1-23-07. Hearing held on February 6 & 7, 2007. Closing arguments submitted in writing. 3-27-07 Hearing Officer issued Decision. Appellant filed Petition for Review. Pending Commission review at its April 18, 2007 meeting. Commission affirmed the decision of hearing officer and denied the Appellant's Petition for Review.	Dismissal Order issued 4/26/07
06-01-010	SDOT	9-14-06	SMC 4.04.230	Whether suspension was for justifiable cause	Appellant alleges suspension imposed was without cause and or/ just cause. Appellant alleges she was retaliated against for her support on behalf of the City against a lawsuit brought by a former City employee. Pre-hearing Conference scheduled for 12- 4-06 rescheduled until January 19, 2007. Hearing scheduled for March 13, 2007. 3-28-07 Findings and Decision issued by the Office of the Hearing Examiner. Pending Commission review at its April 18, 2007 meeting. Commission affirmed the decision of the hearing examiner at its April 18, 2007 meeting.	Dismissal Order Issued 4/18/07

CASE #	DEPT.	FILED	RULE OR CODE	ISSUE	APPEAL SUMMARY/STATUS	STATUS
06-07-008	DPD	4-20-06	SMC 4.04.210	Upward Mobility	irregularities but provided no meaningful remedy, worsening competitive position of several planners well qualified for out-of-class appointment. Appellant notified by letter that Commission will allow appellant until May 25, 2006 to submit briefs citing specific infractions of the law otherwise appeal is dismissed. Received letter from appellant May 24 <sup>th</sup> . Commission to review at its June 21 <sup>st</sup> meeting. Assigned to CSC Hearing Officer for hearing to determine jurisdiction. Hearing Officer Issued Order, 8-9-06 requesting parties to submit briefs. Briefs were not submitted. On 9-21-06, Hearing Officer issued preliminary order on jurisdiction. Respondent given opportunity to challenge appellant's assertion of jurisdiction. Department filed brief, however, brief was in response to CSC No. 06-05-005. Hearing Officer issued 2 <sup>nd</sup> Preliminary Order on 11-2-06 Jurisdiction will be found in matter unless Respondent files brief opposing preliminary finding of jurisdiction by 11-13-06. On 11-13-06, Respondent filed a Brief on Jurisdiction. Appellant had 7 days to respond. The appellant filed no brief. Pending Hearing Officer ruling. Hearing Officer issued a decision on February 5, 2007. The Commission reviewed and affirmed the decision of the Hearing Officer at its February 21, 2007 meeting.	Dismissal Order Issued 2/27/07

CASE #	DEPT.	FILED	RULE OR CODE	ISSUE	APPEAL SUMMARY/STATUS	STATUS
07-04-003	SDOT	1-22-07	Application process for advanceme nt per agreement by and between City of Seattle and IBEW Local 77	Whether promotional process was administered in accordance with established laws, rule, and procedures.	Alleges application process for advancement was not done in accordance of agreement between City and IBEW Local 77. The Commission issued an order on January 25, 2007 requesting parties to submit briefs and relevant documentation necessary for the Commission to determine jurisdiction. The Commission will review the briefs at its February 21, 2007 meeting. The Commission determined it did not have jurisdiction. Appeal dismissed.	Dismissal Order Issued 2/27/07
06-03-014	Fleets	12-4-06		Whether pay raise was denied without due process or notification	Appellant alleges his pay raise was denied without cause or notice Commission reviewed appeal at its December 13, 2006 meeting. Commission requested by order to appellant and department to submit briefs summarizing facts or dispute. The Commission will review at its January 24, 2007 meeting. The Commission found that the appeal was not timely filed. Dismissal Order issued 1-31-07	Dismissal Order issued 1/31/07

#### **PENDING**

CASE#	DEPT	FILED	RULE OR CODE	ISSUE	APPEAL SUMMARY/STATUS	HEARING OFFICER
07-01-004	SEA Center	2-7-07	Pers. Rule 1.3.3 (B) Order of Severity of Disciplinary Action and 1.3.4 (B) Major Disciplinary Offenses	Whether discharge was for justifiable cause.	Appellant alleges altercation between himself and student of the Center High School was an issue of self-defense. 1st Pre-Hearing scheduled for April 4, 2007. Hearing scheduled for June 18-21. Closing Briefs due on July 9, 2007. Decision pending. Decision on Hearing issued by Hearing Officer on July 27, 2007. Pending Commission review at its September 19, 2007 meeting. August 27, 2007 CSC issued an Order for Remedy to parties. Commission affirmed decision of hearing officer. The Commission will issue a Response to Motion and Order on Remedy.	Diane Hess Taylor

## **PENDING BEFORE A COURT OF LAW:**

CASE#	DEPT.	FILED	RULE OR CODE	ISSUE	APPEAL SUMMARY
97-01-006	Seattle Center	3/10//97	Suspension Discharge	Suspended without cause. Claims Last Chance Agreement signed under duress. Discharge without just cause.	Hearing Examiner issued decision on 9/9/97 upholding timeliness on one part of Appellant's motion, but not on another. Court of Appeals remanded case to CSC for review. (CSC believes it does not have jurisdiction over appellant.) Case remains inactive, as Appellant has not pursued since mandate issued by Court of Appeals. Followed up with Law Department 3/4/05 re status of case. Case is still pending.
97-01-016	Parks	8/5/97	Suspension Discharge	Lay-off in violation of Pers Rules	Appellant was Intermittent and appeal was not timely filed Superior Court issued order 2/29/00 reversing CSC. Decision entered 8/17/01, reversed and remanded to trial court to consider appellant's petition. Remains in the discovery phase, no trial date set yet. Followed up with Law Department 3/4/05 re status of case. Case is still pending. Court stayed case pending outcome of "Glaser" case.



THIS IS A SUMMARY OF APPEALS BEFORE THE COMMISSION IN 2008:

## BEFORE THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION:

CASE#	DEPT	FILED	RULE OR CODE	ISSUE	APPEAL SUMMARY/STATUS	HEARING OFFICER
08-01-004	Parks	11-8-08		Whether suspension was for justifiable cause	Appellant alleges the Fact Finding process was "hurried and flawed" and not reviewed for accuracy by her supervisor, delivered to the Deputy Superintendent without thorough knowledge of the project or its needs. Omission of corrections to errors in the Fact Finding did not appear in the final record nor acknowledged. Appellant alleges the she was not a "significant contributing factor" to the project being behind schedule. 1st pre hearing was held on December 9, 2008. Hearing Officer directed parties to discuss and possibly schedule Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR). A CSC hearing is scheduled for February 24 & 25, 2009. December 12, 2008. Received Withdrawal of Counsel and Substitution of Representative.	Diane Hess Taylor
08-02-002	Light	10-1-08		Whether discharge was for justifiable cause	Appellant alleges his discharge was without warning or opportunity to correct action. 1st Per-hearing conference took place on October 22, 2008. Hearing and Discovery schedules set. 2nd Per-hearing(if necessary) is scheduled for November 10, 2008. 3rd Per-hearing (if necessary) is scheduled for November 20, 2008. Hearing is scheduled for December 2 & 3, 2008. A 2nd pre hearing took place on November 10, 2008. The hearing officer ruled on appellant's request for extension to submit witness and exhibit lists. The hearing officer granted the request. The hearing officer also reviewed the respondents Motion in Limine. The hearing officer will rule on the motion on November 14, 2008. Commission Chair Steven Jewell will recuse himself from discussion or action regarding this appeal due to prior involvement in appellant's Loudermill Hearing. The hearing took place on December 2, 3, & 4. The parties will submit Post Hearing Memorandums due December 19. A decision of the Hearing Officer is expected no later than January 13, 2009.	Chris Mathews

### DELEGATED TO THE OFFICE OF THE HEARING EXAMINER

CASE#	DEPT	FILED	RULE OR CODE	ISSUE	APPEAL SUMMARY/STATUS	HEARING OFFICER
			CODE			OFFICER

NO APPEALS DELEGATED TO THE OFFICE OF THE HEARING EXAMINER

#### APPEALS CLOSED

CASE#	DEPT	FILED	RULE OR CODE	ISSUE	APPEAL SUMMARY/STATUS	APPEAL CLOSED
07-01-012	Police  Zahraa  Wilkinson  ACA	10-23-07		Whether discharge was for justifiable cause	Appellant alleges his discharge was based on the lack of a thorough investigation that he did not violate rule 1.003 (III)(A)(1) and alleges termination was based on the lack of a complete police report. 1 <sup>st</sup> Pre-hearing scheduled for December 17, 2007. 2 <sup>nd</sup> Pre-hearing scheduled for April 14, 2008. Pre hearing conference scheduled for June 9, 2008. Hearing continued to July 14, 2008. Appellant requested to withdraw appeal.	Dismissal Order Issued 7-14-08
07-03-013	DoIT	12-13-07		Whether Administrative Leave is justified	Administrative leave. 1st Pre-hearing held January 9, 2008. Hearing scheduled for February 27 & 28, 2008. Closing briefs due April 7, 2008. Decision issued by Hearing Officer. Commission to review at its next scheduled meeting, May 21, 2008. Commission to review draft dismissal order at its next scheduled meeting on June 18, 2008. The Commission reviewed the draft dismissal order at its June 18 meeting. During the appeal the issue of disability accommodations surfaced which are not within the Commissions jurisdiction. Pursuant with SMC 4.04.260(d) the Commission referred the issue to the Seattle Office for Civil Rights. An Order Modifying the Hearing Officer (Diane Hess Taylor) Decision and Dismissal Order was issued.	Dismissal Order Issued 6-23-08

## APPEALS CLOSED

CASE#	DEPT	FILED	RULE OR CODE	ISSUE	APPEAL SUMMARY/STATUS	APPEAL CLOSED
08-03-001	SPU	1-9-08		Whether Classification	accordance with established laws, rules and procedures	ppeal Closed -16-08
07-01-011	SPU Amy Lowen, ACA	8-22-07		Whether demotion was for justifiable cause	Appellant alleges position was reallocated without a selection process in 2005. The department made a demotion and transfer recommendation in 2007. Appellant submitted written appeal (interdepartmental) to department appealing demotion, transfer and additional one year probationary period. Department demoted appellant in 2007 and required appellant to serve an additional one-year probationary period. Reviewed by the Commission at its September 19 meeting and delegated to the Office of the Hearing Examiner. Pre-hearing conference scheduled for October 17, 2007. Hearing scheduled for February 13, 2008 to be rescheduled. Third per-hearing conference scheduled for March 17, 2008. April 16, 2008 Perhearing conference canceled. Appellant withdrew appeal Jun 5, 2008. Dismissal Order issued by the Office of the Hearing Examiner.	6-6-08

#### **PENDING**

CASE#	DEPT	FILED	RULE OR CODE	ISSUE	APPEAL SUMMARY/STATUS	HEARING OFFICER
07-01-004	SEA Center  Paul A. Olsen, ACA	2-7-07	Pers. Rule 1.3.3 (B) Order of Severity of Disciplinary Action and 1.3.4 (B) Major Disciplinary Offenses	Whether discharge was for justifiable cause.	1. Appellant alleges altercation between himself and student of the Center High School was an issue of self-defense. 1st Pre-Hearing scheduled for April 4, 2007. Hearing scheduled for June 18-21. Closing Briefs due on July 9, 2007. Decision pending. Decision on Hearing issued by Hearing Officer on July 27, 2007. Pending Commission review at its September 19, 2007 meeting. August 27, 2007 CSC issued an Order for Remedy to parties. Commission affirmed decision of hearing officer at its September 19, 2007 meeting. The Commission issued a Response to Motion and Order on Remedy September 19, 2007. Appeal in "pending" status until appellant exhausts excess vacation hours carried over to December 31, 2008, or any vacation hours appellant accrued between February 2, 2007 and September 4, 2007, and any other excess vacation hours accrued from September 5, 2007, to December 31, 2007. Commission will issue a dismissal order after 12/31/08.	Diane Hess Taylor

### PENDING BEFORE A COURT OF LAW

CASE#	DEPT.	FILED	RULE OR CODE	ISSUE	APPEAL SUMMARY
97-01-006	Seattle Center  Fritz Wollett, ACA	3/10//97	Suspension Discharge	Suspended without cause. Claims Last Chance Agreement signed under duress. Discharge without just cause.	Hearing Examiner issued decision on 9/9/97 upholding timeliness on one part of Appellant's motion, but not on another. Court of Appeals remanded case to CSC for review. (CSC believes it does not have jurisdiction over appellant.) Case remains inactive, as Appellant has not pursued since mandate issued by Court of Appeals. Followed up with Law Department 3/4/05 re status of case. Case is still pending.
97-01-016	Parks Fritz Wollett, ACA	8/5/97	Suspension Discharge	Lay-off in violation of Pers Rules	Appellant was Intermittent and appeal was not timely filed Superior Court issued order 2/29/00 reversing CSC. Decision entered 8/17/01, reversed and remanded to trial court to consider appellant's petition. Remains in the discovery phase, no trial date set yet. Followed up with Law Department 3/4/05 re status of case. Case is still pending. Court stayed case pending outcome of "Glaser" case.